



DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: THP Training Center – Clover Bottom – Reddit Gymnasium Reroof

Agency: Safety and Homeland Security

Category: Minor

SBC Number: 502/002-02-2016

Project Approval Date: 02/11/2016

Total Project Budget: \$ 488,124.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 425,311.00

Designer Fee: \$ 41,547.00

Project Description: Remove and replace existing roofing system and all related work.

RANKING	RECOMMENDATION
1)	M. Shanks Architects – Firm’s submittal showcased experience on projects of similar size and scope, including working within and operational building. Proposed project team includes a full architectural firm, along with a structural engineer. Project approach was well thought out and included collaboration of professionals, internal document review and coordination.
2)	Design House 1411, LLC – Submittal showcased experience on projects of similar size and scope. Assembled a good team of consultants for MEP and a structural engineer. Project approach indicated familiarity with State process, but lacked detail in regards to scope of actual work.
3)	N/A

Other Firms Submitted: DKRS Architects/Engineers, PLLC

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Various Facilities – Region 1 ADA Facility Compliance

Agency: Tennessee Wildlife Resource Agency

Category: Minor

SBC Number: 220/017-01-2015

Project Approval Date: 07/09/2015

Total Project Budget: \$ 800,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 660,000.00

Designer Fee: \$ 61,836.25

Project Description: ADA improvements

RANKING	RECOMMENDATION
1)	Haizlip Studio PLLC – Firm presented excellent examples of recent and relevant projects that showcase experience with the State and design team continuity. Proposed project team clearly identifies roles of members specific to this project. Consultant experience with design team is also given. Provided a detailed project approach that clearly indicates the firm has a thorough understanding of the scope of work. Office location is within the area of work.
2)	Renaissance Group, Inc. – Submittal showcased work on recent projects of similar scope. Project team is well qualified for the scope of this project. Project approach was well thought out, but lacked finer details. Firm is located within the region of work. Current workload appears to be heavy.
3)	Binkley Garcia Architecture & Interior Design - Submittal indicated that firm has experience on recent and relevant projects. Proposed project team is qualified to complete work of this job, but no indication of team working together previously. Firm's location in Nashville, is outside of area of work. Workload appears moderate to heavy.

Other Firms Submitted: Allen & Hoshall, Inc.; Braganza Design Group; HFR Design; Ledford Engineering and Planning, PLLC.

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Statewide Dam Repair – Various Facilities

Agency: Environment & Conservation

Category: Minor

SBC Number: 126/000-04-2015

Project Approval Date: 07/09/2015

Total Project Budget: \$ 1,950,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 990,847.00

Designer Fee: \$ 89,454.00

Project Description: Repair dams at Dunbar Cave, Fall Creek Falls, Radnor Lake and Reelfoot Lake State Parks, including all related work.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. - Stantec's experience is far reaching for this type of work. Their submittal exhibited projects with identical scopes to our project. They present a strong, in-house, multidisciplined project team. Their project approach was detailed and well thought out and highlighted their familiarity with the sites in question.
2)	N/A
3)	N/A

Other Firms Submitted: N/A

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Cumberland Trail State Park Bridge Construction – Justin P. Wilson Cumberland Trail State Park

Agency: Environment & Conservation

Category: Minor

SBC Number: 126/031-01-2015

Project Approval Date: 07/09/2015

Total Project Budget: \$900,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$770,000.00

Designer Fee: \$ 27,304.00

Project Description: Construct bridges as required throughout the 300 mile length of linear park. Bridges will span creeks and steep terrain obstacles.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	CTI Engineers, Inc. – Based on firm's submittal, they are well qualified to complete the scope of work. Their submittal indicated previous experience on projects of similar scope, including design modifications to eliminate expensive structural costs. Proposed design team consists of in-house engineers and an experienced project manager. The proposed project approach was well thought out.
2)	N/A
3)	N/A

Other Firms Submitted: N/A

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Statewide – Led Lighting Replacement and Upgrades

Agency: Correction

Category: Standard

SBC Number: 140/001-04-2015

Project Approval Date: 12/17/2015

Total Project Budget: \$ 6,288,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 5,463,023.00

Designer Fee: \$ 170,101.87

Project Description: Replacement of interior and exterior lighting with LED lights and controls including all related work.

RANKING	RECOMMENDATION
1)	I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc. – Firm submitted an extensive list of recent and relevant previous projects, that showcased experience with State and TDOC project. Proposed project team is not only well qualified for this project, but they also have experience working with correctional facilities. Project approach very detailed, addressing issues that will be part of this project.
2)	Oliver Little Gipson Engineering, Inc. – Firm’s previous project experience is well aligned with this project’s scope of work, but no indication of working within active correctional facilities. Project team is well qualified to complete this project, technically. Proposed project approach was detailed, but appeared to focus on Designer’s Manual rather than project specific deliverables.
3)	Mazzetti – Firm is experienced on projects of similar size and scope, but submittal indicated no correctional experience. Well qualified project team that included in-house sustainability consultant. Project approach was sufficient, but brief in analysis of current conditions.

Other Firms Submitted: CandleRay LLC; Fisher Arnold; Krell Engineering, LLC; Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: DeBerry Special Needs Facility – LED Lighting Replacement & Water Conservation Upgrades

Agency: Correction

Category: Standard

SBC Number: 142/011-03-2015

Project Approval Date: 12/17/2015

Total Project Budget: \$ 5,082,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 4,583,075.00

Designer Fee: \$ 137,492.66

Project Description: Replacement of interior and exterior lighting with LED lights and controls including high mast lighting; installation of water conservation measures throughout the institution; and all related work.

RANKING	RECOMMENDATION
1)	I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc. – Firm has extensive experience working on projects of similar size and scope. Submittal showcased that the firm and proposed project team have experience working in active correctional facilities. Proposed project approach is well thought out and includes detailed information about investigation and analysis of current systems.
2)	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc. – Submittal showcased experience working on projects of similar scope. Proposed project team included team members experienced on similar projects exhibiting experience with correctional facilities. Project approach is adequate for this project but appeared to lack details on deliverables and innovation.
3)	Oliver-Little-Gipson Engineering, Inc. - Firm has experience working on similar size and scope projects but doesn't appear to have experience working in active correctional facilities. Project team is well qualified for the technical scope of the work. Proposed project approach was thorough on delivery process, but appeared to have some focus on items that might not be part of this project.

Other Firms Submitted: CandleRay LLC; Fisher Arnold; Krell Engineering, LLC; Mazzetti;

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Environmental Assistance Center Existing Building
Commission and LED Lighting – R.S. Gass Complex

Agency: General Services

Category: Minor - Direct Solicitation

SBC Number: 529/020-01-2015

Project Approval Date: 11/12/2015

Total Project Budget: \$ 330,000.00

MACC (Maximum Allowable Construction Cost): \$ 247,500.00

Designer Fee: \$ 24,751.00

Project Description: Replace existing chiller and boiler, and lighting fixtures with LED light fixtures. Existing Building commissioning for the HVAC system to optimize building control performance.

<u>Ranking</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
1)	I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc. – Submitted information showcased a detailed project approach that referenced experience working on State projects. The firm and proposed project team's previous project experience is of similar size and scope. Firm's familiarity with project location is beneficial to this project.
2)	Krell Engineering, LLC – Firm's submitted information showcased experience on projects of similar scope, but slightly smaller size. Small size of firm allows for detailed work, but project approach appeared to lack some detail. Proposed team's workload indicate availability to successfully complete score of work.
3)	N/A

Other Firms Solicited: Olert Engineering, Inc.

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

Project: Statewide – Energy Consultant

Agency General Services

Category: Major

SBC Number: 529/000-01-2016

Project Approval Date: 02/11/2016

Total Project Budget: \$ 150,000.00

MACC N/A
(Maximum Allowable Construction Cost):

Designer Fee: \$ 150,000.00

Project Description: Consultant to support energy conservation analysis projects including; thermal energy systems, solar thermal, PV systems, alternate fuel sources and energy related projects.

<u>RANKING</u>	<u>SCORE</u>	<u>FIRM</u>
1)	88.83	Heery International, Inc.
2)	86.60	Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.
3)	78.10	I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc.

Other Firms Submitted: Allen & Hoshall, Inc.; International Applied Engineering;

DESIGNER EVALUATION SUMMARY

1) Firm: Heery International, Inc.

Comments: Submittal showcased good project experience on recent and diverse projects. Proposed project team includes a good list of consultants, including a solar sub. Project approach showed innovation and included a well thought out, integrated building process, including constructability.

2) Firm: Smith Seckman Reid, Inc.

Comments: Submittal showcased a strong project team and recent project examples. Previous project examples did not highlight innovation. Project approach covered all parts of project but lacked some integration of the entire project team.

3) Firm: I.C. Thomasson Associates, Inc.

Comments: Firm proposed a strong project team that allows for all work to be done in-house. Provided more than adequate examples of previous project experience on recent and relevant projects. Proposed project approach appeared to be standard and included a holistic approach to design and development.

9

LARRY MARTIN
COMMISSIONER



PETER L. HEIMBACH, JR.
STATE ARCHITECT

STATE OF TENNESSEE
DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION
OFFICE OF THE STATE ARCHITECT

WILLIAM R. SNODGRASS TENNESSEE TOWER
312 ROSA L. PARKS AVENUE, SUITE 1800
NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37243-0300
(615) 741-2388

MEMORANDUM

TO: Natalie Hansen

FROM: Peter Heimbach  Peter L. Heimbach,
Jr., State Architect
2016.04.07 13:07:26
-05'00'

DATE: April 7, 2016

SUBJECT: Designer Selection for Project Below the Major Maintenance Threshold

Please be advised that this office has selected the following designer for the listed project based upon your recommendations:

Location:	TWRA – Region 1
Project Title:	Bartlett Gun Range HVAC Replacement
Total Project Budget:	\$325,000
SBC Project No.	220/017-01-2016
Designer:	HNA ENGINEERING, PLLC

This selection will be recorded at the next SBC Executive Subcommittee meeting. You may proceed with the project.

PLH/gm
c: Allen Ray

10

LARRY MARTIN
COMMISSIONER



PETER L. HEIMBACH, JR.
STATE ARCHITECT

STATE OF TENNESSEE
DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION
OFFICE OF THE STATE ARCHITECT
WILLIAM R. SNODGRASS TENNESSEE TOWER
312 ROSA L. PARKS AVENUE, SUITE 1800
NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37243-0300
(615) 741-2388

MEMORANDUM

TO: Natalie Hansen

FROM: Peter Heimbach  Peter L. Heimbach, Jr.,
State Architect
2016.04.13 08:01:15
-05'00'

DATE: April 12, 2016

SUBJECT: Designer Selection for Project Below the Major Maintenance Threshold

Please be advised that this office has selected the following designer for the listed project based upon your recommendations:

Location:	Tennessee School for the Blind
Project Title:	Student Cottages HVAC & Water Heater Replacement
Total Project Budget:	\$404,500
SBC Project No.	168/005-01-2016
Designer:	OLIVER LITTLE GIPSON ENGINEERING, INC

This selection will be recorded at the next SBC Executive Subcommittee meeting. You may proceed with the project.

PLH/gm
c: Allen Ray